Restoring the Agency of Voice through Video-led Cases

For "Values-Driven Entrepreneurship and Societal Impact", editors Kurt April and Badri Zolfaghari, KR Publishing. 2021 (in press)

Martin Hall
Emeritus Professor, University of Cape Town
Associate, Centre for Values Based Leadership, Graduate School of Business

Summary
This chapter explores how video-led case studies can widen and strengthen the impact of curriculum design and delivery across education by restoring the agency of voice. Although counterintuitive, given the acknowledged dominance of visual communication across social media, video remains an underappreciated means for developing and transforming a curriculum. I argue that for education, and specifically for widening the impact of values-led enterprises, the potential of video rests on two key attributes; its democratisation through affordable mobile devices; and its ability to change the subject position – to allow people to speak for themselves.

I develop this argument, and the broader case for curriculum transformation, by drawing on five prototypical video-led cases designed and developed in partnership with the Centre for Values Based Leadership at the University of Cape Town Graduate School of Business. By drawing from the substance and design of these five cases, I show how video can restore the agency of voice. I draw on theories of photography and particularly Margaret Olin's concept of "empowerment photography", which subverts the objectification of traditional documentary formats by inviting the viewer to look through someone else's eyes, with the aid of a facilitator, rather than learning about people under the authority of an instructor. Examples from each of the five video-led cases are used to exemplify Olin's earlier conceptualisation.

By way of conclusion, I look at the more specific opportunities for using video-led cases for exploring values-driven entrepreneurship within professional education; Masters programmes and other kinds of courses offered by universities. I note that, with the rise of digitally enabled "platform economies" , emphasis is shifting from respecting and acknowledging the university as the seat of expertise and authority to requiring assurance that universities can be trusted as intermediaries for information and perspective. Video-led cases can enhance trust by combining the text-based authority of resources and sources of information with direct, visual communication with key figures within the curriculum's narrative.

The five video-led cases accompanying this chapter will be published by the Centre for Values Based Leadership here: https://www.gsb.uct.ac.za/allan-gray-centre

Introduction

The question behind the title of this collection of chapters is: how can values-driven entrepreneurship achieve societal impact? In this contribution, I narrow this broad scope to the curriculum design; the knowledge that is intended to be transferred by means of a course of study and also the context and apparatus for its delivery. Education of all kinds is a primary and expanding mechanism for both reaffirming and transforming the array of learned traditions, assumptions, beliefs and insights that, together, constitute the social world. As with other sectors in the knowledge economy, education is undergoing massive and rapid transformation which is also widening its accessibility.

Focusing on the curriculum has the potential to contribute to the societal impact of innovation in two ways. Firstly, and given the high and rising levels of educational participation, learners are in themselves a significant proportion of society. Secondly, many learners become influencers, incorporating newly-acquired knowledge into their daily practice and advocating to others. In this sense, and in a world where long-established sources of authoritative information and opinion are dissipating, people in themselves become the most viable channels for communicating new knowledge. Consequently, investing in the development and transformation of the curriculum is becoming an increasingly powerful means of achieving societal impact.

Within this frame of the curriculum, I focus on the use of video in learning and teaching, on the basis that video remains an underappreciated means for developing and transforming a curriculum. This may seem counterintuitive; video is everywhere from social media to an explosion of online platforms; video traffic was 75% of all data traffic in 2017 and is predicted to grow to 82% of all data transmitted via the internet by 2022 (Cisco 2019). But in most academic curricula, video is an afterthought that is used to complement textual sources.

This nostalgia for traditional media of instruction misses out on two significant opportunities.

Firstly, the democratisation of visual media is, arguably, one of the more significant achievements of the digital innovation. Until quite recently, making a film was a big budget item, requiring professional videographers and editors. Today, acceptable quality video segments can be assembled by anyone, with a minimum of self-training, using a phone and a readily available editing application. This provides for a compelling immediacy in producing curriculum materials, that is in step with the pace of innovation and change in our contemporary world.

Secondly, video provides the curriculum designer with the opportunity to change the subject position; to let people speak for themselves. Traditionally, as academics, we write and teach "about" people. This applies whether or not we take a position on the issues covered in a curriculum; we still end up describing and analysing what we believe other people have experienced, what they feel, and what they want. Visual media allow those who are part of what we teach to be heard directly. In turn, this shifts the locus of power in the transmission of knowledge. Rather than self-representing as the definitive authority, whether by intent or default, the academic/teacher becomes more of a facilitator, orchestrating the assembly of the curriculum.

In the rest of this chapter, I will make this argument through reference to five experimental, video-led case studies developed as part of the work of the University of Cape Town Graduate School of Business's Centre for Values Based Leadership. These cases are very

different, on a spectrum from a for-profit company developing online courses for international enrolment, to a NGO campaigning for the right to basic healthcare, they share a commitment to the primacy of values, understood as "principles, standards, or qualities considered worthwhile of desirable" (McNamara, 2012). In turn, these values have shaped the ways in which each enterprise is run; "management by values", "a managerial philosophy and practice whereby focus is concurrently maintained on an organisation's core values and aligned with its strategic objectives" (Dolan, Garcia and Richley 2006). Each of these cases is available online, under a Creative Commons licence, allowing readers to see for themselves.

Enabling the power of speech

Communicare is a speech and language therapy practice based in Massachusetts, USA, that specialises in Augmented and Alternative Communication (AAC). AAC works with people who require assistance to speak, and primarily with children and young adults who have speech and language disorders. In their work, Communicare's clinicians emphasise that AAC is, in itself, a form of language, with sets of rules and symbols that enable communication without speech. The technologies deployed to achieve this end range from pen and paper to sophisticated eye-gaze technology, in which the user communicates by looking at symbols on an interactive digital display:

"We love what we do! We specialize in Augmentative and Alternative Communication (AAC), Assistive Technology (AT), Applied Behavior Analysis (ABA), Speech-Language Pathology, and Special Education. We provide comprehensive services in the areas of assessment, intervention, consultation, training (professional development), and tele-AAC. We strive to empower our community through authentic connections and high quality, evidence-based service provision". (Communicare 2019)

As an enterprise, Communicare works at the intersection between the state and the commercial sector. The majority of Communicare's clients are public schools. Over the past decade, the State of Massachusetts has outsourced significant elements in special needs education to private practices in order to reduce costs, while at the same time preserving the right of access to special needs support for people under the age of 21. Over the same period, the increasing pace of digital innovation has created a specialised industry in digital devices and applications to provide those in need with access to AAC. As with many forms of clinical practice, this creates a tension between the need for the practice to maintain and improve margins in order to run the practice as an enterprise and the ethics of providing clients with the solutions best suited for their needs. For example, in some cases "light tech" solutions – crayons and poster boards – may be a better technology for a specific need than the purchase of a sophisticated, and expensive, digital device.

These values come through strongly in the positions taken by Communicare's clinicians and in the video-led case that serves as the example here; in the work of their annual summer camp for AAC-users and paramedics; and in the commitment for getting the appropriate mix of solutions in place for each client and their family, irrespective of the technology.

A passion for spreading the word

Together, Africa World Press and GetSmarter span more than four decades of publishing, exemplifying the transition from books to fully online courses.

Kassahun Checole was born in Eritrea, then occupied by Ethiopia. Expelled from university in Addis Ababa in 1969 for political activities he moved to New York and returned to his home city of Asmara. In 1971 he was able to travel to New York, gaining a Masters degree in Sociology and an academic post at Rutgers University. In 1983, inspired by activist academics in Mexico, Kassahun founded Africa World Press from his apartment in Trenton, New Jersey.

In this video-led case study, Kassahun sees his three decades in publishing as shaped by a series of four definitive challenges: establishing a market for African books; his commitment to a free Eritrea; his resistance to the domination of US trade publishers; and the survival of Africa World Press in the digital age of Amazon.

Kassahun had been inspired to launch Africa World Press by the spirit of self-determination that he had experienced in Mexico, which resonated with his commitment to Eritrean independence. He defines this as a mission to offer Africa-centred books: "Africa is the world and the world is Africa". This was refined through a set of editorial themes: religion, sociology and economics, and African literatures. But, in approaching the established trade book stores, he was told that there was no market for books from or about Africa because "black people don't read". Faced with this resistance, Kassahun set up his own distribution company, Red Sea Press, and worked with others to create a market by setting up independent book stores across the US. By the end of the 1980s Africa World Press was well established, with a strong list of titles and a clear identity, supported by a network of independent book stores.

Kassahun had been actively involved in politics since his university days in Addis Ababa. When he left home in 1971 he had joined the Eritrean Peoples' Liberation Front (EPLA); he continued to support the EPLA in its opposition to Ethiopia's occupation of Eritrea through the time he was living in the US. In 1991, Eritrea achieved its independence and Kassahun decided to return home, arriving back in Asmara the following year. His vision for Eritrea was the establishment of a modern printing press, that could meet the needs of both Eritrea and the broader East African region, particularly in providing books for education. He succeeded in establishing the press, which is still running today. But in May 1997, war had broken out between Eritrea and Ethiopia. Fighting continued until 2000, but with no political settlement. Vehemently opposed to the policies of the Eritrean government, Kassahun was again forced into exile in the USA.

Returning to his home in Trenton in 2001, Kassahun set about rebuilding Africa World Press. Trade book sellers such as Barnes and Noble had now realized that there was a market for books from and about Africa and used their competitive advantage in discounting to put many of the independent book stores out of business. Trade sellers would hold stock for many months for display purposes and then return books unsold, with no revenue for the publisher. Africa World Press's book distributor became insolvent, resulting in the loss of a large amount of stock. Kassahun responded to this crisis by turning to new and innovative processes of digital printing, allowing small print runs and reprints on demand, avoiding large capital outlays and warehousing costs. Kassahun sees this innovation as saving Africa World Press from collapse.

The challenges from trade book stores had been accentuated by the growing reach of Amazon.com through the 1990s. In rebuilding Africa World Press, Kassahun realized that working with Amazon would be essential. While commercial publishers could offset the

discounts on mass-selling titles through very large print funds and lower unit prices, this option was not available to the small publishers that were now using digital technology to print on demand. Kassahun's strategy was to depend on Amazon for individual titles but to insist that bulk orders from college and university book stores are purchased directly from Africa World Press. Kassahun also had the foresight to keep some of his warehousing facilities or his direct sales. As a result, today about 30% of AWP's sales are through Amazon, and 70% are dispatched directly, free of the high discounts that Amazon demands. Africa World Press has a catalogue of over 1000 titles, bringing out new books every year (Africa World Press 2019).

Enterprises such as GetSmarter are both the antithesis and the natural successors of book publishers like Africa World Press. As online publishers – in this case of education courses – their business models are built on the possibilities and promises of the digitally driven "platform economy" of which Amazon is the early exemplar (McAfee and Brynjolfson 2017). In this, GetSmarter is the nemesis of traditional publishing. But as natural successors, online publishers have the opportunity to build on the legacy those book publishers driven by the values of opening knowledge to all. Between 2008, when GetSmarter was founded by brothers Sam and Rob Paddock, and 2016, when the company was sold, GetSmarter grew from under 400 student registrations a year to over 17 000; a fifty-fold increase in the dissemination of knowledge.

Sam Paddock saw the possibilities of online education in 2004, when he was studying Business Science Information Systems at the University of Cape Town: what would it be like to be able to study entirely online? Sam's father had pioneered the introduction of flexible learning opportunities for lawyers specializing in property management and this resonated with the emerging possibilities for online learning. Sam founded GetSmarter in 2008 with his brother Rob. Their first course was in partnership with the University of Stellenbosch.

The opportunities in online learning are closely linked with digital innovation and the exponential-like increase in digital capacity. Increases in access to connectivity has combined with key digital innovations in processing power, bandwidth, transmission speeds and the declining cost of cloud storage resulting in a striking increase in the global generation of digital information. Back in 2004, when Sam was building a model for a virtual classroom as a UCT student, the world was producing about 0.1 zettabytes of new digital information annually. By 2017, the production of digital information had increased two-hundredfold, to about 20 zettabytes each year, or the equivalent of three terabyte drives of new information for every living person in the world (Meeker 2018).

Over its first four years, GetSmarter was strikingly successful in building on these opportunities. The number of students enrolled across all courses had increased tenfold. Course presentations had increased by a factor of twenty, from three in 2008 to 60 in 2012. And the team had grown from just three in the company's first year to 75 in 2012. But, as Sam explains in the ChangeMaker case study, the business had hit a wall, finding it increasingly difficult to deal with the consequences of rapid growth and the expectations of their partner organizations. GetSmarter's big strategic leap, made after two years of introspection between 2012 and 2014, was to offer only short courses.

GetSmarter also decided to move into the international arena, with initial partnerships that included the Cambridge Institute for Sustainability Leadership, Goldsmiths College University of London, the University of Chicago and the Massachusetts Institute of

Technology. By June 2016, GetSmarter had more than 1000 international students from across the world. But because GetSmarter's business model required that the company undertook almost all course development costs, and also underwrote the consequences of student enrolments not meeting targets, the scale of this expansion also increased the level of financial risk to the business. It was necessary to capitalize the business and this resulted in the decision to sell GetSmarter to 2U Inc., a large online programme management company in the US.

Over these years of growth, from start-up success to substantial business, GetSmarter had pioneered the use of online provision to expand educational opportunity in South Africa. The apartheid years, which had ended with the first democratic government of 1994, had left the persistent legacy of a discriminatory and under-resourced educational system that had prevented many people with ability and potential to get access to the schooling that they deserved, or to gain university-level qualifications. High quality online courses, certificated by leading South African institutions such as the universities of Stellenbosch, the Witwatersrand and Cape Town, enabled people in employment to smash against glass ceilings. Completion certificates were used as evidence for specific competences required by employers, or to provide the basis for alternative routes into graduate programmes; the "recognition of prior learning" permitted in terms of South Africa's regulations for admission into higher education.

Africa World Press and GetSmarter have been, from their inception, enterprises that have been driven by sets of core values. In this, both Kassahun Checole and Sam Paddock meet widely- accepted criteria for "transformational leadership": a clear, articulate and credible vision for the future direction of their organisations; "social architects" who orchestrate shared values and a distinctive institutional culture; leaders who establish by making their own positions and commitments clear; and a strong sense of self-awareness and how to use their own strengths and weaknesses (Bennis and Nanus 2007; Northouse 2019). Despite the tensions inherent between traditional book publishing and online provision, they share a driving concern to make knowledge and expertise available to as many people as can possibly be reached within the means of the mechanisms available to them.

Driven by a passion for justice

At first sight, Mandla Majola and Sokari Douglas Camp could not be more different: a health rights activist born and raised in a South African township; a sculptor born in Nigeria, working from her studio and London and widely recognised for the striking aesthetics of her art. What unites them in the ChangeMaker case studies is that they are both driven by the values of fundamental human rights and social justice, and that these values have shaped and directed their work over many years.

Mandla Majola was born and brought up in the Cape Town township of Gugulethu. When his aunt died painfully in 1999, Mandla became aware of the devastating HIV and AIDS epidemic that was sweeping across South Africa. For the next 15 years, Mandla was part of the TAC's national leadership.

AIDS was formally defined by the US Centre for Disease Control and Prevention in 1982. Since then, this global epidemic has taken about 35 million lives, and some 70 million people have been infected with the HIV virus. Africa is the most severely affected region, with nearly two-thirds of all those with HIV living in the continent: about 1 in every 25 adults (WHO 2018). By the early 1990s, it was clear that AIDS was reaching epidemic proportions

in South Africa, with the South African National Health Department reporting that the number of recorded HIV infections had grown by 60% in the previous two years and was expected to double in 1993. But at this time, medical options were limited and prohibitively expensive. Despite initial optimism, early treatment regimens were disappointing. There were well-promoted claims for alternative treatments, and scepticism about the very existence of AIDS (Mbali 2005). The Treatment Action Campaign was founded in December 1998 to campaign for access to treatment for HIV and AIDS in South Africa.

Looking back, Mandla tells the story of the TAC as three major campaigns: the fight against Pfizer patent rights for fluconazole; the campaign for healthcare to prevent mother-to-child transmission of HIV; and the push for universal access to medication for those living with HIV and AIDS.

The Treatment Action Campaign's fight for access to fluconazole was set in the larger international context of patent rights, the pricing of drugs, and rights of access to generic medicines. Fluconazole had initially been developed by a team at Pfizer Central Research in the UK in 1981 and was protected by a patent awarded to Pfizer. The drug was approved for use in the USA in 1990, and was marketed by Pfizer as Diflucan.

As in many other parts of the world, patented drugs such as Diflucan were too expensive in South Africa to be made available to all who needed them through the public health system. South Africa's new Constitution of 1996 had set the principle of the right of everyone to have access to health care and a new Medicines Act, passed by Parliament in 1997, was intended to give effect to this provision by allowing the parallel production of generic drugs that could be made available at prices far lower than their branded equivalents. But in early 2000, when activist Christopher Moraka died from cryptococcal meningitis and the TAC launched a campaign in his name, the Medicines Act had not been enforced.

In April 2000, after protests at Pfizer's offices in Johannesburg and Cape Town, the company announced that it would donate Diflucan to AIDS patients in South Africa, in collaboration with the Ministry of Health. But this did not meet the TAC's demand that the price of Diflucan should be lowered to the level of generic production. The TAC continued with the campaign, announcing at an international AIDS conference in July 2000 that it would "smash Pfizer's patent". TAC leader Zackie Achmat made the comparison with Thailand, where a generic version of fluconazole was legally available at a fraction of the price of Diflucan in South Africa. Later that year Achmat, in an act of public defiance, illegally imported 5,000 doses of generic fluconazole from Thailand, distributed them in South Africa without charge and then "confessed" his crime to the police (Cullinan 2000; PharmaLetter 2000).

Prevention of mother-to-child transmission (PMTCT) programmes provide HIV-positive pregnant women with antiretroviral treatment to reduce the risk of their unborn babies acquiring the virus. If HIV-exposed infants are given antiretroviral treatment within their first 12 weeks of life, they are 75% less likely to die from an AIDS related illness. The TAC argued that pregnant women had the right of access to a short course of the drug AZT to reduce the risk of their child being infected with HIV during and after birth. The TAC widened its scope to include access to a second antiretroviral, Nevirapine which works to prevent the multiplication of the HIV virus, and complements AZT where women breast-feed their babies. In response to the TAC's case, the government stated that AZT and Nevirapine were too expensive to be provided through the public health system and - in an argument led directly by President Thabo Mbeki - that the relationship between HIV and AIDS was

unproven. The TAC took legal action against the government, winning its case in the Pretoria High Court in December 2001. Following the government's appeal against the High Court ruling, the TAC took its case to the Constitutional Court, which ruled in favour of the TAC and the right of access to healthcare services in July 2002 (Mbali 2003; Heywood 2009; AVERT 2018a).

Following the success of the PMTCT campaign, the TAC decided to push for all of those living with HIV and AIDS to have the right to appropriate treatment through the public health system - "universal access". This campaign was launched in February 2003 with a protest by 20 000 people in Cape Town, on the day that President Thabo Mbeki was delivering the annual "State of the Nation" address in Parliament.

The objections to providing a national treatment plan for HIV and AIDS were twofold. Firstly, the government deemed universal access unaffordable. But while it was indeed the case that low-cost generic alternatives to patented medicines were still not available in South Africa, the lack of affordable treatment was also because the government had systematically refused price reductions and donations of drugs by multinational companies, and had blocked international aid to provide medication (Chigwedere et al. 2008). These actions are explained by the second reason that the government refused to contemplate a national action plan: AIDS denialism. While there had long been an alternative view that the connection between HIV and AIDS was unproven, these arguments had, for the most part, not derailed the steady advance of effective public health policies in other countries. But, uniquely in South Africa, denialism was enthusiastically embraced by the government and the ruling party, and explicitly by the head of state: Thabo Mbeki, South Africa's President from 1999 until 2008. Faced with this wall of opposition, the TAC decided to sharpen its tactics with an explicit campaign of civil disobedience, launched on 21 March 2003 - Human Rights Day -with the occupation of police stations across the country in an attempt to lay charges of culpable homicide against Health Minister Manto Tshabalala-Msimang and Trade and Industry Minister Alec Erwin (Mbali 2005).

The following five years saw a series of incremental victories as a broad alliance of activists, health care specialists and workers, civil society movements, international organisations and a broad swathe of the South African public pushed against the obdurate denialism of Thabo Mbeki, Manto-Tshabalala Msimang and other senior figures in the ANC government. Finally, and in 2007, the TAC was able to engage with government to draft a national plan for HIV and AIDS, which was endorsed by the Cabinet on 4 May 2007. By March the following year, when the TAC held its National Congress, 450 000 people were receiving treatment for HIV and AIDS through the public health sector.

The effects of the AIDS denialism of President Thabo Mkeki, Health Minister Manto Tshabalala-Msimang and other senior government officials has been calibrated through a sophisticated statistical model published by Harvard University's School of Public Health. This study estimated that 330,000 lives, or approximately 2.2 million person-years, were lost because a feasible and timely ARV treatment program was not implemented in South Africa. An estimated 35 000 HIV-positive births could have been avoided if the required mother-to-child transmission prophylaxis programme had been introduced in South Africa at the time that it was first available. In comparison with South Africa, neighbouring Botswana, under the leadership of President Festus Mogae, introduced a PMTCT programme in 1999, followed by national ARV access in December 2001. By 2005, Botswana had 85% ARV

treatment coverage, as opposed to 23% ARV coverage in South Africa (Boseley 2008; Chigwedere et al. 2008).

As a direct consequence of the work of the Treatment Action Campaign and allied organisations, South Africa now has the largest antiretroviral therapy programme in the world. As a result of universal access to antiretroviral therapy programmes - the focus of TAC's successful civil disobedience campaign - overall life expectancy is steadily increasing, from 61.2 years in 2010 to 67.7 years in 2015. And in 2015, South Africa met the World Health Organisation's global target of reducing mother to child transmission of HIV by 90%. But the challenge of eradicating HIV and AIDS is still formidable, with 18.9% of the South African population infected (AVERT 2018b).

After standing down from the TAC's leadership group in December 2015, Mandla Majola completed his Master's degree in Public Health at the University of Cape Town and graduated in March 2016. He then joined the School of Public Health at the University of Cape Town, with the role of coordinating community projects working in the Cape Town townships of Gugulethu and Khayelitsha. Using his experience in strategy, learned through his years with TAC, Mandla realised that better progress could be made by forming a coalition of community based organisations. He founded the Movement for Change and Social Justice, bringing together some fifteen groups with shared objectives, and continues to campaign for the constitutional right of everyone in South Africa, irrespective of their circumstances, to equitable and affordable health care.

Sokari Douglas Camp was born in Buguma, a coastal town in Nigeria's Rivers State that is the seat of the Kalabari Kingdom. In 1967, at the outbreak of the Nigerian Civil War, she moved to Britain to complete her schooling, but returning frequently to her home town. She studied art at the California College of Arts and Crafts (1979-1980), at the Central School of Art and Design in London (1980-1983) and at the Royal College of Art (1983-1986). She has lived and worked in Elephant and Castle, London, for more than thirty years. Her work has been recognized in many awards, including a CBE in 2005, an Honorary Fellowship of the University of the Arts London in 2007 and a Fellowship of the School of Oriental and African Studies, University of London, in 2017.

Rivers State's capital, Port Harcourt is the centre of Nigeria's oil industry. Commercially viable crude oil and gas reserves were first discovered in 1956; today's Rivers State has two major oil refineries, port facilities, airports and industrial estates and produces more than 60% of Nigeria's total oil output, a sector accounts for about 8.5% of Nigeria's GDP. Shell, in partnership with the British government, began oil production in the region in 1958. Between 1976 and 1991, some 3 000 oil spills were reported in the area, totalling about 2 million barrels and about 40% of Shell's oil spills across the world as a whole. In 2011, the United Nations Environment Programme reported that, as a result of oil spills, the alluvial soils of the Niger Delta are no longer fit for cultivation. UNEP has estimated that rehabilitation will take some 30 years (Crayford 1996; UNEP 2011).

Protests against pollution and the destruction of the rich ecosystem of the Niger Delta were led by Kenule Saro-Wiwa, a writer, television producer and founder of the Movement for the Survival of the Ogoni People (MOSOP 1991). Saro-Wiwa was imprisoned by the Nigerian military government in 1994 and, with eight others, was sentenced to death and hanged on 10 November 1995 (Lewis 1996). The execution of the "Ogoni Nine", along with accusations of complicity with Nigeria's military dictatorship, brought international attention to Shell's

record of environmental pollution, the exploitation of local communities and alleged human rights abuses. Legal cases against Shell have been brought continuously since 1996 (Mouawad 2009). In November 2017 Amnesty International published a review of internal Shell documents, as well as records from its own archives, relevant to events in the Ogoniland region during the Nigerian military dictatorship. Amnesty's allegations have been denied by Shell Nigeria (Amnesty International 2017; Shell Nigeria 2018).

Sokari's work as an artist has been focused and directed by the environmental destruction of the Niger Delta, by the actions of the Nigerian government and by the seeming complicity of Shell. Many of her sculptures are inspired by the Kalabari masquerades that are performed across twenty-year cycles to portray and invoke water spirits that are found in the mangrove swamps (Brighton Museums 2015; Sokari Douglas Camp 2019). Sokari's "Battle Bus: Living Memorial for Ken Saro-Wiwa" was completed in 2006. This full-size sculpture travelled across Britain for nine years before being dispatched to Lagos in 2015. The planned tour of Nigeria was at the request of the Ogoni Solidarity Forum-Nigeria and other Nigerian organisations, both to continue the campaign to clean up the Niger Delta and to mark the 20th anniversary of the execution of the Ogoni Nine (Platform 2018). However, the Battle Bus was impounded by Nigerian customs at Lagos and has yet to be released (Rustin 2015).

A second theme, running through Sokari's more recent work, is the legacy of slavery. The Act for the Abolition of the Slave Trade was passed by the Parliament of the United Kingdom in 1807 and prohibited the slave trade in the British Empire. The bicentennial of this landmark legislation was marked in a range of exhibitions and art commissions across Britain, inspiring a continuing strand in Sokari's work as an artist.

Here, Sokari's work is best represented by "All the World is Now Richer". This installation comprises six striking life-sized figures, welded in steel and representing stages in the legacy of history: a figure in West African robes prior to the devastation of the slave trade; a plantation worker and a domestic slave; a nineteenth-century liberated ex-slave in the distinctive dress of the time; a twentieth century executive in a suit and tie; and a relaxed figure – "Tee-shirt Man" – in casual clothes, looking for his heritage. Together the group stands on a grid composed of the words of a liberated ex-slave, William Prescott: "they will remember that we were sold but they won't remember that we were strong; they will remember that we were bought but not that we were brave."

"All the World is Now Richer" was exhibited in the House of Commons in 2012 and then in Bristol Cathedral, Norwich Cathedral and St George's Hall in Liverpool. It was shown again in St Paul's Cathedral, London, in 2014 and as part of the Diaspora Platform project during the Venice Biennale 2017. Sokari sums up her objective for this work: "how do you show that the people of slave heritage are brave and have dignity and strength? How do you show the social and economic legacy that has benefited the world from their suffering?" (Diaspora Pavillion 2017; October Gallery 2019).

As with Mandla Majola's steadfast commitment to the provision of affordable and humane health care, so Sokari's advocacy as a sculptor has consistently pushed for basic human rights, environmental justice and recognition of the continuing legacies of slavery. Both are powerful expressions of values based leadership.

Empowerment photography

A key point – and the focus for this paper – is that video-led cases, of the kind represented by Communicare, Africa World Press, the Treatment Action Campaign, Sokari Douglas Camp and GetSmarter, can achieve greater impact than conventional, text led curricula by restoring the agency of voice. More specifically, this is achieved through two mechanisms: the democratisation of video as a medium of communication; and the shift of the focal point, transforming traditional subject of academic discourse into an active agent in the curriculum.

This point can be expanded, figuratively and literally, through returning to the Communicare case. The democratising of video stems from the ubiquity of video functionality on smart phones. Working with children and young adults at Camp Communicare demonstrated repeatedly that the phone is the device of choice in capturing and communicating narratives for children with special needs. Often, and whether or not deliberately, children with special needs become objects of pity in text-led cases and traditional documentary formats; a narrator or expert talks about them and paraphrases what they cannot do. In contrast the intimacy of the phone medium allows both closeness and trust, both because the technology is far less intrusive than specialised videography equipment, and because the phone is now a familiar artefact, worth barely a glance.

This ubiquity of mobile devices brings significant practical benefits to a values-led organisation such as Communicare, since accessible technology and easily usable editing applications remove many cost barriers. In turn, lower production costs encourage and allow more rapid renewal of curriculum content, improving the quality of continuing professional development for practitioners and, from this, the provision of better quality care. As part of their ongoing practice, and in order to support their work in Continuing Professional Development with the American Speech-Language-Hearing Association (ASHA).

Again – and literally as well as figuratively – AAC as a language directly restores the agency voice to those who have previously been denied speech. As with other forms of agency, empowerment has two requirements: the technical competence of the agent, in this case children and young adults learning AAC as a new language; and adaptation to, and acceptance of, AAC as a language by communication partners. The ChangeMaker case explores both sides of this coin in depth. The intimacy of the video medium shows the compelling ability of AAC users, some under the age of 10, to master grammatical structure and vocabulary using technology as the medium. In parallel, the visual narrative provides a visceral sense of how we need to abandon unfounded assumptions and address what Dolly Chugh has termed the "unintended biases of good people" (Chugh 2018). In this Communicare's values-driven mission is to work within the opportunities afforded by the Massachusetts public schooling system to empower children and young adults in need by both teaching them to communicate using augmented and alternative instruments, and by removing the prejudices and social barriers that prevent them from being heard.

In a more general and abstract sense, the massive popularity of video enabled by ever more accessible technologies and social media reaffirms some earlier insights about photography and, in particular, Margaret Olin work on "empowerment photography". Olin sees photography as "gestural practice": "just as a painter gestures with brushes at a canvas to describe space, objects, people, and ideas, and lecturers gesture at audiences to describe ideas or to connect to their listeners, so photography's gestures function to describe ideas and things and to connect people" (Olin 2012: 11). This connection is dependent on the role of a facilitator: "all these ways of disseminating photographic activities to people(s) who are

suppressed, oppressed, or voiceless, or who belong to an unrecognized nationality dispersed in a diaspora, entail an interaction between a community and a teacher who comes armed with a belief in the empowering potential of photography" (Olin 2012: 136). For Olin the key distinction is that, where documentary photography asks the viewer to look at a subject, empowerment photography invites viewer to see through someone else's eyes. The distinction is not in the images themselves, but in the intention for their use. Applying this to the Communicare ChangeMaker case, the intention is not offer a documentary about children with disabilities, but rather to see the world through their eyes, mirroring the inadvertent prejudices that may prevent us from hearing their voices.

Olin's metaphor of the gesture serves well to describe the approach to making the other four ChangeMaker cases described in this paper. None were scripted. In each case, the request was to tell the story of the enterprise and of the objectives and values that gave it momentum; in Olin's terms the viewer is invited to "look through someone else's eyes" rather than to watch a "subject". In each case, this dialogue approach prompted new insights and forms of expression: for Sokarai, of her art as "her way of writing"; in Sam's case, of strategy as "people doing things"; for Kassahun, reflection on the writers who have shaped his thinking; and for Mandla the recollection of being abused by police during the TAC campaign for universal access.

Professional is personal

How, then, does this "gestural practice" shift the needle in producing video-led cases for values based leadership?

A first common point across the ChangeMakers prototypes is that the distinction between professional and personal personas blurs into irrelevance. This is particularly relevant to understanding how, in some enterprises, values come first. Africa World Press was initially shaped and defined by Kassahun Checole's experiences in Mexico, and the ways in which literature shaped national identity. This resonated with his commitment to Eritrean independence and inspired his curtailed return to Asmara in 1992. In rebuilding the business from 2001, Africa World Press has consistently prioritised the significance of a manuscript over its sales potential, in sharp distinction with the large majority of other publishers. While this may have reduced profitability, this values-led approach has resonated with a significant global community of partners and readers. Combined with Kassahun's innate qualities as an entrepreneur, Africa World Press has defied the odds and now has a unique position as a progressive, pan-African, publishing house.

In different ways, the values that have propelled both Sam Paddock's and Mandla Majola's work originated in their families. In some respects, these personal backgrounds could not be more different; the Cape Town township of Gugulethu and the affluent suburb of Rondebosch on the slopes of Table Mountain; a geography set by the institutionalised segregation of apartheid. Yet, when given the voice to shape their stories and priorities, both start with their families. Mandla traces his commitment to fighting for rights to basic healthcare to his aunt's death and to his dismay that his family was unable to talk about a sexually-transmitted disease. This has shaped a determination to fight back against prejudice and, in his reflections on camera, hones his anger and dismay at President Thabo Mbeki's AIDS denialism and its consequences. Sam attributes his commitment to education – GetSmarter's "audacious goal" of "changing a million lives" – to family values and to his father's determination to overcome the University of Cape Town's inherent conservatism and reluctance to open up access to education.

Sokari Douglas Camp's values based leadership comes from a combination of the political imperative of moving beyond the legacies of empire and colonialism and her family context. Her sculptures and aesthetics have been shaped by her childhood memories of Kalabari masquerades and their ever changing and evolving modalities. Her political commitment to environmental justice originates in her dismay at Shell's devastating and cynical destruction of the rich ecosystem of the Niger Delta; in her visual narrative, she vividly recalls driving from Lagos to Port Harcourt and seeking the horizon black with smoke from the refineries and burning oil spills. She attributes the second theme that runs through her work – the legacy of slavery – to the right to dignity, an approach that rejects the dominant documentary trope in which slaves are objectified as victims. This is why she often returns to the single recorded phrase from a otherwise-unknown slave, William Prescott: "they will remember that we were sold but they won't remember that we were strong; they will remember that we were bought but not that we were brave." Here, Sokari's values based leadership is her continuing push for public sculpture in London that commemorates slavery through strength and bravery rather than as victimhood.

Their way of writing

A second common attribute across this diverse set of ChangeMakers is that, as unscripted conversations, they tend towards the teleological. Such narratives selectively interpret the past from a present condition, parsing away circumstances and events that at the time could have been significant, but which have subsequently proved irrelevant. This, in turn, attributes causality, whether explicitly or by implication. Sam Paddock is explicit in this in telling GetSmarter's story. Looking back, he is clear that the difficult, high-risk decision to focus on short courses for working professionals, and to abandon other business directions, allowed the company to reach many more students without the encumbrance of the regulations that apply to accredited qualifications. However, he also acknowledges that this clarity comes with hindsight; getting to the decision point took two years of arguments, debates and false starts

Both Kassahun Checole and Mandla Majola attribute their circumstances at the point of their interviews to a logical chain of campaigns. For Kassahun this is fourfold; the founding of Africa World Press, the return to Eritrea, the fightback against the trade book stores, and achieving an accommodation with Amazon and the new world of publishing. Mandla's campaign history with the TAC is the fight for generic patents followed by the push for medication for pregnant women, leading to the victory in the Constitutional Court and universal access to medication.

Sokari presents a more nuanced narrative; appropriately so given the nature of her work. As an artist her reach extends beyond words, encompassing the aesthetics of her sculptures and their interpretations of shapes, textures and colours. As such, this is her "way of writing", that will be diminished by any attempt to reduce the work to words alone. In her case the teleological effect comes from her choice of which works to choose from an extensive catalogue; the story of the Battle Bus from conception through until its confiscation by Nigerian customs authorities; the individual sculptures and their imagined histories that, together, comprise the "We were Brave" installation.

In the traditional, more academic, documentary mode teleology is "one-sided", "biased", "subjective", requiring counter-balancing points of view. But to go down this road is to return the authority of voice to the third-person narrator who stands outside and above the

conversation as adjudicator; the umpire in an intellectual tennis match. This runs contrary to the primary objective of the ChangeMaker cases; the restoration of the power of voice. For many applications of "empowerment photography", that make use of the new and still-emerging opportunities of digital video, restoring voice is an end in itself. But for cases such as the ChangeMaker series, that are intended for use in the context of formal curricula, the objection of subjectivity and bias has to be addressed in order to project the validity of these new style narratives.

The approach adopted in producing and publishing these protypes has been to accompany each visual narrative with signposts to sources that both provide material that is complementary to the visual narrative, and which present counterarguments and contrary points of view. It is then left to those making use of the ChangeMaker cases to find out for themselves and to make up their own minds. Clearly, it would be naïve to claim that there is neutrality in this device. Just as the facilitator is central to Olin's concept of empowerment photography, so are these visual narratives shaped from the point of filming, on through the processes of editing, and into the selection and publishing of complementary materials. But necessary facilitation of this kind is distinct from both documentary reportage and from the traditional academic mode of writing, in which an all-knowing expert presents a "correct" version of events.

Beyond words

Like Sokari Douglas Camp's striking, life-sized steel sculptures, leadership is often about presence. Leadership presence can be dominant and pervasive; the personality that fills a room and a persistent theme in theories of leadership. Equally, though, leadership can be a subtle presence that invigorates others; the "servant-leader" tradition (Northouse 2019). Presence can also be asserted indirectly, and negatively. For Sokari, the continuing presence of Nigeria's General Sani Abacha, in both his life and after his death, is part of her continuing journey. The communication of these various forms of leadership invariably extends beyond the limits of words. Dress codes and uniforms; mannerisms and music; ceremonial representations of authority. These visual dimensions of leadership make up a third and common strand across this set of ChangeMaker cases.

Non-verbal forms of communication are all the more significant for values-based leadership. The concept of "organisational values" is a clumsy shorthand, and institutional values that exist only as words are generally seen as meaningless and vacuous. Values that work are invariably embodied in real people and are often augmented by anything from facial expressions and body language through to settings, workplaces, architecture and landscapes.

This embodiment gives power to the visual and is a source of rich opportunities for photography in general, and by for video. The power of photography, both benign and threatening, was peeled apart by Susan Sontag in her formative set of essays, "On Photography", first published in 1977. Here's an extract from "The Image-World":

"Photographs do more than redefine the stuff of ordinary experience (people, things, events, whatever we see – albeit differently, often inattentively – with natural vision) and add vast amounts of material that we never see at all. Reality as such is redefined – as an item for exhibition, as a record for scrutiny, as a target for surveillance. The photographic exploration and duplication of the world fragments continues and feeds the pieces into an interminable dossier, thereby providing possibilities of control that could not even be dreamed of under the earlier system of recording information: writing" (Sontag 1977: 156).

For this ChangeMaker series, non-verbal communication is evident across the cases, from Mandla Majola to Sokari Douglas Camp.

Mandla Majola's presence does not come across strongly in the reflective, narrative mode of the primary conversation. This makes the switch to the short clip of him leading a demonstration in Canada against Health Minister Manto Tshabalala-Msimang all the more compelling. Here, we see and experience the presence and charisma of the activist and community leader, and we are able fully to understand why he was effective, over some fifteen years, as a national leader of a widely recognised and acknowledged, values-driven NGOs.

Sam Paddock's leadership style epitomises the embodiment of values. This is evident from the opening sequence of the ChangeMaker case, as he orchestrates the movements and expressions of the entire GetSmarter team. Here, and elsewhere in this narrative and in numerous other clips of GetSmarter at work, we can see how embodied leadership becomes an integral part of the day-by-day behaviours of the team as a whole; the shorthand of "organisational values", at the enterprise level.

For the Communicare ChangeMaker case, the rich sense of the learning and communication environment could not be achieved with verbal representations alone. Here, the video medium and the depiction of non-verbal communication is essential. The field of practice of Augmented and Alternative Communication depends on visual images, whether through use of minimal technologies, such as paper and crayons, or via sophisticated computer screens. In addition, voice simulation depends on sound. Consequently, the non-verbal properties of video are serve both to express what Communicare is about and also to counter the inadvertent biases that prevent people from hearing those who are trying to communicate in these ways.

Sokari Douglas Camp is, not surprisingly, the most comfortable in moving beyond words and her explanations of her art are quiet, self-depreciating, almost reluctant. This serves to push the visual and tactile qualities of her sculptures into the foreground, refusing the reductionism of words alone. This is evident in her presentation of "Europe supported by Africa and America", a life-sized composition of three female figures. This sculpture was inspired by William Blake's 1796 print, made in support of the abolition of slavery. In Sokari's interpretation, the women are dressed in contemporary clothing. The central figure holds a wreath that morphs into a fuel hose; part of a rich and complex set of references to the contemporary issues that drive Sokari's work as an artist (Houghton 2016).

Restoring the Agency of Voice in Vales-Driven Entrepreneurship

To end, and by way of conclusion, how can the approach set out here – video-led cases – contribute to the societal impact of values-driven entrepreneurship? Here, I will stay with the field of the curriculum while again narrowing the scope, now to the design and delivery of programmes offered to influencers in graduate programmes and courses, ranging from full Masters degrees through to short courses. Overall rates of participation in higher education are still growing. UNESCO estimates that global enrolments grew from 32.6m in in 1970 to just under 100m in 2000, a 206% increase over three decades. By 2015, global enrolments had doubled to 214.1m and UNESCO predicts that just under 600m students will be enrolled in universities and colleges across the world by 2040 (Calderon 2019). Clearly, promoting

change through the higher education curriculum is an effective means of reaching a very large number of people.

While growing, higher education is also changing in step with all other aspects of the knowledge economy. These changes cab be conceptualised in terms of the "platform economy" (McAfee and Brynjolfson 2017). The distribution of many goods, and particularly digital services and products, is increasingly mediated by digitally enabled platforms that are vertical, in the sense that they are becoming essential intermediaries between products and services, on the one hand, and customers on the other. Amazon is the exemplar here, and Kassahun Checole's work in refining Africa World Press to enable it to survive in this new economy is exemplary of the realignment imposed on traditional businesses. As universities move increasingly into blended and fully online learning, whether out of choice or financial necessity, they are becoming less like traditional, bounded, campuses and more like digital platforms. Indeed, this insight was the basis of GetSmarter's success; as Sam Paddock describes it in the ChangeMaker case, GetSmarter learned that a university's brand value is sometimes more important than its formal degree-awarding powers.

A consequence of the emergence of the platform economy is a shift in emphasis from authority to trust. The exponential expansion of digital media makes it difficult, and sometimes impossible, to establish the value and authenticity of new insights and exemplars in terms of their own merits, particularly when there are multiple claims, and false claims, to authority. In these circumstances, the reputation of a university, represented by its brand, serves as a proxy for trust. When incorporated into the curriculum of a trusted university, video-led cases will further enhance trust by combining the text-based authority of resources and sources of information with direct, visual communication with key figures within the curriculum's narrative. For example, and drawing on the protype cases that have been described here, Sokari Douglas Camp's video-based narrative, along with the visual power of her art, engenders trust in the sincerity of the long campaign for environmental justice for those who bear the direct brunt of fossil fuel extraction.

This agency of voice gains its valency – its societal impact – though the reach and richness of widely available, and affordable video. In turn this empowers what Walter Mignolo calls "border thinking" – the values and insights of those on the margins of traditional methods of knowledge creation and distribution (Mignolo 2011).

In this set of prototype ChangeMaker cases, access to "border thinking" gives Mandla Majola and Sokari Douglas Camp platforms to advocate powerful and alternative perspectives to the institutional narratives of global corporate institutions, in particular the pharmaceutical and oil industries. Sam Paddock thinks and talks from the edge of curriculum innovation, pushing universities to widen access to knowledge and opportunity. Kassahun Checole makes the case for independent publishing in the wake of Amazon's gigantean path. In a contrasting frame, Camp Communicare's video-led agency allows some those consigned to societal border zones by prejudices against "disabilities" to push back against the hubris of the assumed normal.

References

Africa World Press 2019. Africa World Press. http://africaworldpressbooks.com/about-us/

Amnesty International 2017. "Investigate Shell for complicity in murder, rape and torture". 28 November 2017. https://www.amnesty.org/en/latest/news/2017/11/investigate-shell-for-complicity-in-murder-rape-and-torture/

AVERT 2018a. "Prevention of mother-to-child transmission". https://www.avert.org/professionals/hiv-programming/prevention/prevention-mother-child Accessed November 2018

AVERT 2018b. "HIV and AIDS in South Africa". https://www.avert.org/professionals/hiv-around-world/sub-saharan-africa/south-africa accessed November 2018

Bennis, W. G., and Nanus, B. 2007. *Leaders: The strategies for taking charge* (2nd ed.). New York, NY: Harper & Row.

Boseley, Sarah 2008. "Mbeki Aids denial 'caused 300,000 deaths'". Guardian, 26 November. https://www.theguardian.com/world/2008/nov/26/aids-south-africa accessed November 2018

Brighton Museums (2015). "Kalabari Masquerade". https://brightonmuseums.org.uk/discover/2015/02/26/kalabari-masquerade/

Calderon, Angel 2018. "The higher education landscape is changing fast". University World News, 28 June. https://www.universityworldnews.com/post.php?story=20180622085558 53

Chigwedere, Pride, Seage, George, Gruskin, Sofia, Lee, Tun-Hou, Essex, M. 2008. "Estimating the Lost Benefits of Antiretroviral Drug Use in South Africa" Journal of Acquired Immune Deficiency Syndromes. 49 (4): 410-415 https://journals.lww.com/jaids/Fulltext/2008/12010/Estimating_the_Lost_Benefits_of_Antiretroviral.10.aspx

Chugh, Dolly 2018. *The person you mean to be: confronting Bias to Build a Better Workplace and World.* New York, HarperCollins

Cisco 2019. Cisco Visual Networking Index: Forecast and Trends, 2017–2022 White Paper. https://www.cisco.com/c/en/us/solutions/collateral/service-provider/visual-networking-index-vni/white-paper-c11-741490.html

Communicare LLC 2019. "What we do". https://www.aaccommunicare.com/what-we-do

Crayford, Steven 1996. "The Ogoni Uprising: oil, human rights and a democratic alternative in Nigeria". Africa Today 3 (42): 183-197.

Cullinan, Kerry 2000. "Campaign for cheap drugs from Thailand". Health E-News, 14 July 2000. https://www.health-e.org.za/2000/07/14/campaign-for-cheap-drugs-from-thailand/ Accessed November 2018

Diaspora Pavilion 2017. "All The World Is Now Richer Meets The Woman Who Refused To Dance". https://www.seditionart.com/sokari-douglas-camp/all-the-world-is-now-richer-meets-the-woman-who-refused-to-dance

Dolan, S., Garcia, S. and Richley, B. 2006. *Managing by Values: A corporate guide to living, being alive and making a living in the 21st century.* New York: Palgrave Macmillan.

Meeker, Mary 2018. "Internet trends, 2018". https://www.kleinerperkins.com/internet-trends

Heywood, Mark 2009. "South Africa's Treatment Action Campaign: Combining Law and Social Mobilization to Realize the Right to Health". Journal of Human Rights Practice, 1 (1): 14-36

Houghton, Gerald 2016. "Primavera: Sokari Douglas Camp C.B.E." London, October Gallery. http://www.octobergallery.co.uk/bookstore/sokari_catalogue_2016.pdf

Lewis, Paul 1996. "Blood and Oil: A Special Report. After Nigeria Represses, Shell Defends Its Record". New York Times, 13 February. https://www.nytimes.com/1996/02/13/world/blood-and-oil-a-special-report-after-nigeria-represses-shell-defends-its-record.html

Mbali, Mandisa 2003. "HIV/AIDS policy-making in post-apartheid South Africa". 318-320 in Daniel, J, Habib, A and Southall R, State of the Nation: South Africa, 2003-2004. Cape Town: Human Sciences Research Council Press)

Mbali, Mandisa 2005. "The Treatment Action Campaign and the history of rights-based, patient-driven HIV/AIDS activism in South Africa". Centre for Civil Society, University of KwaZulu-Natal, Research Report 29. http://ccs.ukzn.ac.za/files/RReport_29.pdf Accessed November 2018

McNamara, C. 2012. *What are values, morals, and ethics?* Available: https://managementhelp.org/blogs/business-ethics/2012/01/02/what-are-values-morals-and-ethics/ .

Mignolo, W. D. 2011. *The Darker Side of Western Modernity: Global Futures, Decolonial Options*. Durham, Duke University Press.

Andrew McAfee and Erik Brynjolfson 2017. *Machine, Platform Crowd: Harnessing our Digital Future*. New York, W.W. Norton

MOSOP 1991. "The Ogoni Bill of Rights". http://www.bebor.org/wp-content/uploads/2012/09/Ogoni-Bill-of-Rights.pdf

October Gallery 2019. "Sokari Douglas Camp". http://www.octobergallery.co.uk/artists/sokari/index.shtml

Olin, Margaret 2012. *Touching Photographs*. Chicago, University of Chicago Press

Northouse, Peter 2019. *Leadership: Theory and Practice*. London, SAGE Publications.

PharmaLetter 2000. “Pfizer plans to give fluconazole free to South African AIDS patients”. 4 April 2000. https://www.thepharmaletter.com/article/pfizer-plans-to-give-fluconazole-free-to-south-african-aids-patients Accessed November 2018

Platform 2018. “Update: The Bus, its seizure and our story”. May 14 https://platformlondon.org/2018/05/14/update-the-bus-its-seizure-and-our-story/

Porter, M.E. and Kramer, M.R. 2011. Creating shared value. *Harvard Business Review*. (January-February).

Rustin, Susanna 2015. “Ken Saro-Wiwa memorial art bus denied entry to Nigeria”. Guardian, 5 November. https://www.theguardian.com/environment/2015/nov/05/ken-saro-wiwa-memorial-art-bus-denied-entry-to-nigeria

Shell Nigeria 2018. “Shell debunks Amnesty allegations on spills management in Niger Delta”. Media release, March 18. https://www.shell.com.ng/media/2018-media-releases/shell-debunks-amnesty-allegations.html

Sokari Douglas Camp 2019. Work. http://sokari.co.uk/

Sontag, Susan 1977. *On Photography*. London, Penguin.

UNEP 2011. “Environmental Assessment of Ogoniland”. United Nations Environment Programme, Nairobi. https://wedocs.unep.org/bitstream/handle/20.500.11822/25282/ogoniland_chapter1_UNEP_OEA.pdf?sequence=1&isAllowed=y